



i-Rec – Oeuvre durable student competition

9th student competition – IATROGENESIS

Disrupting the status quo: Resisting disaster risk creation

June 7th, 2019

Jury Report

The competition jury met on Wednesday June 5th at the University of Florida School of Architecture.

Members of the jury:

Jeff Carney (chair)
Diana Contreras
Giuseppe Forino
Haleh Mehdipour

BACKGROUND ON THE COMPETITION

From the brief: This competition focuses on resisting disaster risk creation in natural and human systems. Solutions must address both the products and the processes of intervention. Participating projects are expected to reflect on the following themes: people, planet, prosperity, peace and partnership.

The competition invites participants to:

1. Explore how interventions in the built environment can contribute to the protection of rights and freedoms, especially those of historically marginalized and excluded social groups, in situations of post-disaster and post-conflict reconstruction, recovery, and disaster risk reduction.
2. Explore innovative ways to tackle the root causes of vulnerability in a context of ongoing disaster risk creation.
3. Study comprehensive solutions to reduce inequalities in land ownership, tenure, and urban planning.
4. Show how architecture and/or urban projects can contribute to protecting resources and nature and aiding the recovery of ecosystems.
5. Explore how urban planning and design interventions can help reduce corruption in recovery attempts, empower affected populations, and avoid top-down and paternalist strategies often adopted by humanitarian actors.

6. Examine sustainable solutions to forced displacement of people. Reconsider the importance of design interventions in temporary spaces of refuge (such as refugee camps and informal settlements) that often become permanent.
7. Explore how design interventions can mitigate climate change and how science can reduce the denialism adopted by governments for specific political agendas.
8. Examine the technical aspects of physical construction or reconstruction, and present a scenario for an organizational design that articulates the participants, their actions, their resources, and how they will be made available.

APPROACHES/CRITERIA FOR JURY:

1. Context
2. Technological approach to buildings, infrastructure, and settlement from a perspective of resisting disaster risk creation
3. Organizational approach and logistics

THIS YEAR'S ENTRIES

OVERALL ENTRY STATISTICS

- The jury truly enjoyed reviewing the 27 submissions.
- Projects submitted from 10 countries
- Many of which were projects designed in other countries.
- There were submissions in 5 different languages
- Projects ranged in scale from the home to the region and tapped a broad range of disciplinary skill sets.

NOTES ON THE WORK OVERALL

- The capacity to address disaster risk creation in an original way
- The potential for transformation and innovative thinking
- The attention to social and environmental justice
- Effective aesthetic representations of place from region to architecture
- Architectural design skills including volume, proportion, and material
- Functionality and economy of means
- The articulation of the design with the surroundings
- The use of local materials such as bamboo or wood
- The consideration of meeting points and evacuation risk
- The climate efficiency of the design
- The consideration of the socio-economic condition of the inhabitants
- The engagement of communities and local actors in place development
- Productive (farm, work) projects in the development site
- We appreciate to have a large variety of projects in different scales and that several of the projects address the topic of refugees, in a world that became a world of refugees in Jordan, Lebanon, Greece, Bangladesh and Colombia.

Overall Critique (Things to think about for next year)

- Not articulation of the design with the surroundings
- Feasibility of the projects – opportunity to DESIGN the feasibility

- Constructive details, e.g. bamboo into water
- SIMPLICISTIC consideration of environment
- Lack of problematization of conflicts between actors
- Design mistakes. Eg. such as locate the social toilette in front of the main door, locate two social toilettes in one apartment
- Connectivity from urban to architectural scale

WINNERS

3rd Place - Low Income Post-Earthquake Reconstruction, Sarpol Zahab, Iran

Students:

Somaye Zandie

Shahid Beheshti University, Faculty of Architecture and Urban Design, Tehran, Iran

Abstract

Sarpol Zahab is a city in Kermanshah province, Iran. On November 12, 2017, a major earthquake occurred close to the Iran-Iraq border, causing extended damage and casualties in this city. In this disaster, the Fooladi and the public housing neighborhoods (Maskan Mehr) sustained the highest level of damage.

In the present research designing is conducted though SWOT technique in which environmental, social, economic and physical criteria are considered and it is tried to optimally use the strengths and opportunities by re-designing the block system and the access system and providing the required functions.

Vision of the project is to propose a low income post-earthquake construction. It follows by four goals: increased resilience, social solidarity, compromise with the nature and sustainable context-oriented architecture.

Creating different building types, public space, predicting emergency accommodations, defining semi-open spaces and others. are main factors for designing the new neighborhood.

Furthermore, In the reconstruction plan, the pre-disaster materials are used to attain the goals for the revival of the identity and sense of place of the neighborhood.

JURY COMMENTS

- Overall this is solid response through urban design
- New but contextual scale, materials and solutions
- Good arrangement of buildings
- Would like to see more in terms of how this new arrangement is resistant to earthquakes and how it actually performs in a future event.

2nd Place - Palenque El Manglar, Cartagena, Colombia

Students:

Julian Alberto, Olaya Rojas

Pontificia Universidad Javeriana, Bogota, Colombia

Abstract

Housing prototype for the current occupants of Marlinda and Villa Gloria's settlements, located

on the northwestern edge of Cartagena de India's Ciénaga de La Virgen, due to the imminent flood risk situation in which their homes remain due to the nature of the landfill of the territory in which they settle.

We will proceed to the formulation of the basic outline of an urban plan for the area corresponding to the neighborhoods, which includes definition of uses, road layout, buildability and a scheme of management and financing, in addition, will be carried out the design of level of constructive detail of the housing prototype that technically solves the care of the ecosystem, and the permanent exposure to floods.

This is intended to offer a decent housing option, framed in the law, which provides high standards of quality of life and comfort to its occupants. Reason why, and because of the integral and multidisciplinary interest of the proposal (social, cultural, environmental, urban and architectural), is that it is a model that could be registered as an alternative to the ruling of relocation of this community by the Council of State.

JURY COMMENTS

- Solid understanding and documentation of context
- Good documentation of current housing typologies
- Articulate comments of community members
- Knowledge of current policy
- Sophisticated/provocative housing design
- Problems: housing design does not speak to questions of urbanism. Some concerns also arise over the reality of the bamboo/water interaction
- Capacity to address risk creation by looking at local materials

1st Place - Reusing the Waste Reusing the Vasto, Napoli, Italy

Sudents:

Ciro Commitante

Antonio Di Giorgio

Simona Makoski

Mariagrazia Serafino

Eliana Staiano

Department of Architecture, University of Naples Federico II, Napoli, Italia

Abstract

Vasto is a Neapolitan district located close to the Ancient Center and the Central Station. It arose in the nineteenth century on a marshy area, known as Guasto, word that means rotten, malfunctioning, ruined, like many areas of the contemporary territory, in which the city relegates troublesome functions and marginalized communities. For this reason, in these areas, there is a progressive development of slow violence: a form of violence that is not impetuous, but gradual and incessant. These processes remain under track for a long time, until some sudden event triggers the conflict.

This is what has happened to Vasto, which has first hosted earthquake victims and then, recently, masses of migrants, whose presence has escalated into a phenomenon of disputed public space, caused by the different habits of the communities here confined. This interpretative reading of the physical conditions and dynamics concerning the territory is the

basis of a cooperation strategy aimed at activating a series of HUBs. These places of connection hold the different ideas of public space, specific to each community and, above all, they facilitate the activation of processes that involve different actors. Through a win/win logic, everyone is able to improve his life condition.

JURY COMMENTS

- Very well laid out and communicated visually.
- Design appreciates the complexity of human, social, and community system
- Comprehensive perspective on conflicts and networks between local stakeholders
- Compelling presentation of human connections and social space as way to build community capacity
- Strong planning/organizational focus
- Capacity to avoid risk creation by looking a long term visions for community dialogue and urban sustainability.

PANEL CONVERSATION QUESTIONS

1. Competitions allow us to go beyond the known, the allowable, to explore what is “right”, what is “responsible”. What is the role of competition to the field of disaster response?
2. Designers have a lot to consider in their education: schools, hospitals, housing, materials, structure... How should design education deal with disasters?
3. In competitions first impressions matter. There is a large (possibly outsized) role for aesthetics in a competition. What role should design aesthetics play in design competitions and by extension disaster planning and recovery more broadly?